



Civil Rights Department Commission on the State of Hate

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | contact.center@dfeh.ca.gov

COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE

Meeting Notice and Agenda

May 24, 2023

Commissioners Present

Chair Russell Roybal
Commissioner Cynthia Choi
Commissioner Regina Cuellar
Commissioner Andrea Beth Damsky
Commissioner Cece Feiler
Commissioner Brian Levin
Commissioner Shirin Sinnar
Commissioner Erroll G. Southers

Civil Rights Department Staff Present

Adam Romero, CRD Deputy Director
Becky Monroe, CRD Deputy Director
Alec Watts, CRD Deputy Director
Mariel Block, CRD Senior Legislative and Regulatory Counsel
Marquez Equalibria, CRD CCRU
Gregory Mann, CRD CCRU
Christina Teixeira, CRD CCRU

Others Present

An estimated 18 members of the public participated virtually.

I. **Welcome** A. **Call to Order**

Chair Roybal called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

They welcomed everyone to the fifth meeting of the California Commission on the State of Hate. Announced translated captioning is available for this meeting.
Chair Roybal acknowledged that it is both AAPI Heritage Month and Jewish American Heritage month.

B. Establishment of a Quorum

CRD Assistant Deputy Director, Alec Watts conducted roll call.

C. Review of the Agenda

Chair Roybal invited everyone to the Commission's first Community Forum that will take place following the Commission meeting. They then reviewed the public comment process.

Chair Roybal reviewed the agenda for the meeting.

II. Approval of the Minutes

Chair Roybal reviewed the minutes from the April meeting and asked for comments, discussion, and public comment on the minutes.

No edits by Commissioners.

Public Comment

No public Comment

Action by the Commission

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve the minutes. Commissioner Choi seconded. The Commission unanimously voted to approve the minutes.

III. Discussion and Action Regarding the Commission's Annual Report

Chair Roybal reminded everyone the Commission's Annual Report is due July 1, 2023, and that the Commission will discuss and take a vote to adopt this version of the report. They then reviewed the overall structure of the report.

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve the current version of the Commission's Annual Report. Commissioner Choi seconded.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Damsky thanked staff and Chair Roybal for their work on the amount of detail that went into the report.

Chair Roybal commended the staff for their hard work throughout the editing and drafting process of the report and laying the groundwork for the future.

Commissioner Choi noted her appreciation that the feedback regarding demographics were essential to develop strategies that would be most responsive to disproportionately impacted communities. She also agreed with Chair Roybal that this was an important first report, because its foundational to the work of the Commission.

Commissioner Levin acknowledged the quick timeline in which the report was written. Additionally, he thanked the amount of work that went into the Commission's Annual Report by the fellow Commissioners and CRD staff.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

Action by the Commission

Chair Roybal moved to a vote with the caveat that if there are any copy edit changes that need to be made, the CRD staff can make those non-substantive changes.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the Commission's Annual Report.

Additional Comments by Commissioners

Chair Roybal gave a round of applause for the milestone.

Commissioner Southers asked how this report will be released.

- Alec Watts responded that the CRD is working on how to best distribute the Commission's report.
- Chair Roybal noted that he had a conversation with the CRD's new Director of Communications regarding spreading the word about the report.

IV. Updates from Chair and Subcommittees

A. Chair Russell Roybal

Chair Roybal gave the following updates:

Following this meeting, the first community forum will take place virtually at 11:30. Additionally, they were recently in Sacramento to represent the Commission at the Jewish Public Affairs Council (JPAC) Capitol Summit.

Commissioner Southers was appointed to the LAPD Police Commission.

- Commissioner Southers thanked Chair Roybal.
- Commissioner Feiler gave her congratulations to Commissioner Southers.

Commissioner Feiler inquired about the location of the following Commission meetings.

- Chair Roybal responded that the Bagley-Keene Act is moving through the Legislature on whether the Commission will continue with virtual meetings or transition to a hybrid model.

Vice Chair Salcedo was awarded the Latino Spirit Award by the California Latino Legislative Caucus.

Commissioner Cuellar was recently honored with a resolution from the California State Assembly for her work on AB 1314, a bill to create the Feather Alert System to notify the public when a Native American person goes missing or is endangered.

- Commissioner Cuellar thanked Chair Roybal.

Chair Roybal responded to Commissioner Souther's inquiry about where the report will be available, informing everyone that the Report will be posted on the Commission Website for Commissioners to share.

B. Subcommittee on Data and Research

Commissioner Sinnar provided the following updates:

The Subcommittee has been setting up contracts to accomplish three goals: (1) Develop rigorous data and research in areas related to the prevalence, prevention, and response to hate incidents, (2) translate existing and new research to bridge the gap between research and policy, and (3) make all the data and resources accessible to California communities.

There are five projects that are in the works at various stages. First, they are working with the California Health Interview Survey put out by UCLA Center for Health Policy. Second, the Subcommittee brought on a Sociology PhD and Law student as a consultant to help put together literature reviews on public messaging to help prevent hate crimes. Thirdly, they are developing collaborations with academic hate crime researchers, the Commission, CRD staff, and policymakers to bridge conversations of research and policies. Fourth, they are creating a user-friendly searchable format so community members, organizers, and media can access hate crime related demographics and resources. Lastly is a project focusing on funding research related to anti-trans violence in California, hate crime incident reporting data, and other non-law enforcement data sources.

The Commission has put out a notice for an in-house researcher who can work on other data and research needs as well as looking for other options down the road.

Commission discussion

Commissioner Cuellar asked how the Health Surveys will be distributed.

- Commissioner Sinnar replied that the goal is to be representative survey but is supposed to be representative of all the demographics.

- Alec Watts added that he believes the surveys are mostly through mail and there will be follow-ups if someone doesn't respond. The survey is both representative at both the State and county level.

Commissioner Levin discussed the changing and emerging political threat of violence perpetuated by public officials by not participating in anti-terrorism hearings and spreading misinformation. He highlighted that the Subcommittee and Commission is focused on nonpartisan, academic, and scholarly driven data.

C. **Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations**

Commissioner Choi gave the following update:

The Subcommittee met with Abby Browning to discuss the role of governments in the aftermath of a hate incident. There's an understanding that the infrastructure across the state is uneven in times of crises and there are community organizations that don't always reach out to the government. To counter this, the Subcommittee is working on approaches that do not cause further harm to the communities that have been directly impacted.

Commissioner Cuellar thanked Commissioner Choi for the update and Becky Monroe, and Abby Browning for their contributions.

Commission discussion

Commissioner Sinnar asked if there are other substantive areas that will be focused on, such as: (1) hate incidents not only hate crimes, (2) What is the role of government in crisis response, and (3) Are there additional areas of research that could help since these are topics that the Commission is interested in.

- Commissioner Choi responded that the Subcommittee wanted to prioritize rapid and crisis response. There will also be additional information in the Presentation by Stop AAPI Hate at the Community Forum. The subcommittee has a consultant that will help them identify this by tracking hate crimes, hate acts, and civil rights violations. Because these topics become predictors in where we need to shift our focus both locally and nationally.
- Commissioner Cuellar added that her county has held discussions regarding how different local governments respond to any kind of hate activities, and this is something that is good for the Subcommittee to also look at.

Commissioner Levin noted that when there are higher ranking leaders speaking out on hate crimes incidents reports show there is a decline in hate incidents. There are organized and directed type of violence that is not just spontaneous. Therefore, it is so important to have these actionable types of resources available to help combat hate crimes when they occur.

D. **Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement**

Commissioner Damsky shared the following updates:

The Subcommittee is focusing on how to create hate crime and incident-related trainings for law enforcement officers. This includes creating training videos with the help of students, academics, and notable people who will be compelling representatives for law enforcement officers.

An important goal is to encourage officers to engage with their communities to build relationships so the impacted communities will reach out to law enforcement. One place to start is to encourage jurisdictions to have listening sessions with their communities to learn about the biggest threats they are facing. This will help inform the subcommittee on what types of training will fill the gaps.

There have been discussions regarding college campuses and the prevalence of hate crimes in those institutions.

The subcommittee recommends that there be literature reviews conducted and it may potentially bring on a consultant. They also met with Becky Monroe from the Civil Rights Department and Cynthia Deitle who formally worked for the FBI.

Commissioner Southers contributed the following updates:

The work is being done using a holistic approach and the law enforcement has been enthusiastic about helping and wanting to help bridge gaps in communities they want to reach. The trainings will be POST certified.

Commission Discussion

Chair Roybal was glad that that the commission met with Becky Monroe.

E. Subcommittee on Community Forums

Commissioner Feiler discussed the following updates:

The first Community Forum will take place after the Commission meeting. She also discussed the topics of the forums.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Cuellar discussed her excitement for the forum.

Chair Roybal expressed that they are sad they will not be able to attend but is excited to watch the recording

Commissioner Feiler Thanked Alec Watts for his work and the CCRU team.

Public Comment:

One member of the public discussed the underreporting of hate crimes against the disabled community. They asked Commissioner Sinnar if the surveys will have a special focus on people with disabilities.

- Commissioner Sinnar responded that she does not know off hand but will be looking into that.

F. Subcommittee on Funding

This update was skipped at the meeting.

V. Commission Member Announcements

Commissioner Feiler talked about her Mental Health Summit at UCLA and announced she will be taking over as the board Chair of the UCLA Resnick Neuro Psychiatric Hospital next month.

Commissioner Levin shared that Over 500 LGBTQ+ pieces of legislation are happening right now and there are growing numbers of hate crime attacks with the biggest increases being against the LGBTQ community. His research on this will be coming out soon.

Commissioner Damsky announced that she spoke on anti-LGBTQ hate crimes at her local City Council meeting where they discussed proclaiming June as LGBTQ pride month and flying non-government flags which would have prevented flying the pride flag. The motion failed.

- Chair Roybal let the public know that the Commission did not take a position on the resolution as the Commission does not have a process for that yet, though staff is looking into that.

Commissioner Feiler asked Commissioner Levin when his research will come out.

- Commissioner Levin said the research should be out sometime next week but there will be a sneak-peek at the Community Forum presentation.

VI. Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

The Commission may not discuss or act on any matter raised during the public comment section that is not included on this agenda, except whether to decide to place the matter on the agenda of a future meeting. (Government Code §§ 11125 and 11125.7 (a))

A member of Islamic Networks Group noted that they provide presentations, panels, and diversity training seminars on islamophobia, anti-semitism, anti-black racism, and other forms of bigotry. They recommended that the Commission form a subcommittee on hate-based bullying in schools due to disproportionate bullying occurring against Muslim students. They also would be happy to help serve on that Subcommittee.

- Chair Roybal asked them to forward any information they have to the Commission's email.

Another member of the public wants the Commission to take a position on AB 1079 and AB 449.

VII. Future Agenda Items

Chair Roybal encouraged Commissioners to discuss in their subcommittee meeting about future

agenda items and to email them or Alec Watts to get their topic on the next Agenda. They asked if there are any other comments before they move to adjournment.

Commissioner Feiler wanted to confirm which Commissioners will be attending the Community Forum.

- Chair Roybal responded that Commissioner Sinnar, Commissioner Southers, Commissioner Levin, and Commissioner Damsky will be attending.

VIII. Adjournment of the Meeting

Commissioner Cuellar moved to adjourn. Commissioner Levin seconded. Chair Roybal adjourned the meeting at 10:24 a.m.



Civil Rights Department Commission on the State of Hate

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | contact.center@dfeh.ca.gov

COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE

Notice and Agenda

May 24, 2023, 11:30 a.m.

Commissioners Present

Vice Chair Bamby Salcedo
Commissioner Regina Cuellar
Commissioner Andrea Beth Damsky
Commissioner Cece Feiler
Commissioner Brian Levin
Commissioner Shirin Sinnar
Commissioner Erroll G. Southers

Civil Rights Department Staff Present

Adam Romero, CRD Deputy Director
Becky Monroe, CRD Deputy Director
Alec Watts, CRD Deputy Director
Marquez Equalibria, CRD CCRU
Gregory Mann, CRD CCRU
Christina Teixeira, CRD CCRU

Others Present

An estimated 75 members of the public participated virtually.

I. Welcome a. Call to Order

Commissioner Cuellar welcomed everyone at 11:31 a.m.

She reviewed the process for translated closed captioning. Commissioner Cuellar introduced herself and had the following Commissioners introduce themselves: Commissioner Feiler, Commissioner Damsky, Commissioner Sinnar, Commissioner Southers, and Commissioner Levin.

Commissioner Cuellar explained the public comment process. She then discussed the goal of the Commission and the forum.

Commissioner Cuellar reviewed the agenda.

b. Establishment of a Quorum

II. Informational Presentations on the State of Hate

Commissioner Cuellar introduced the first speakers Candice Cho and Annie Lee.

b. Righting Wrongs: How Civil Rights Can Protect Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders

Candice Cho started the presentation with:

An introduction as to who and what Stop AAPI Hate is and how they define hate. They based their definition of hate on what the community and data are telling them.

She shared three stories on what anti-AAPI racism looks like. These were just three of 11,000 reports they have received since March 2020. Some of the trends they found are: 1 in 5 Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders experienced hate since the start of the pandemic, a large amount of hate is non-criminal (e.g., harassment, bullying, etc.), and most of these incidents were occurring in public. A survey was conducted in November and December to collect more data.

Annie Lee continued the presentation and discussed the following:

The results from the survey showed that a significant number of Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders experienced discrimination. Data regarding where the discrimination occurred, the impacts of it, the victim's experience reporting, and if people wanted to know more about their civil rights were discussed. Most Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders reported trusting community groups the most for reporting and receiving civil rights information.

Two-thirds of Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders in California said they want new civil rights laws to reduce discrimination.

Candice Cho talked about the next steps:

Focusing on solutions outside of the criminal legal system because relying on the police for all the solutions comes at a cost to other communities who are disproportionately and unjustly targeted by law enforcement. Most AAPI community members want comprehensive solutions.

Two recommendations for states and local governments: (1) invest directly in AAPI Community infrastructure and (2) direct public agencies to address bias-motivated harassment in public spaces. She then explained the API Equity Budget, the No Place for Hate California campaign, and CA v. Hate.

Commissioner Cuellar thanked presenters and introduced the next presenter, Commissioner Levin.

a. **Hate Crime Trends: A Changing Threat and Invisible Records**

Commissioner Levin presented the following:

Reviewed frequently asked questions and areas with limited data availability. The data reveals a low number of prosecutions under current hate crime laws.

Major cities across the country are experiencing increases in levels of hate crime or incidents, dependent on city size. FBI data indicates an increase in violent hate crimes, particularly against the black and LGBTQ communities. Such crimes tend to occur more frequently during the second half a year, often correlating with catalytic events. In California, reported hate crimes have reached a multi-year high.

Demographic data illustrates that the targets for hate crimes differ based on local demographics. However, some groups face significant underreporting. Densely populated cities generally provide more accurate data. It is crucial to enforce existing protections for vulnerable groups against militia groups seeking to harm them.

Commissioner Levin emphasized the significance of the Commission's work and the importance of researchers sharing the current hate crime data, particularly when the data reflects some of the highest numbers of hate crimes in the last 30 years. Therefore, the Commission be an ally to these communities.

Commissioner Cuellar thanked Commissioner Levin for his presentation.

Public Comment

Commissioner Feiler reminded everyone of the public comment process.

The first public commenter disagreed with the notion that the AAPI community mostly support a non-carceral approach, instead advocating for stronger hate crime laws and increased local law enforcement presence. They also raised concerns about unhelpful language as it relates to inner group violence. In conclusion, they urged the Commissioners to not shy away from the tough questions.

The second commenter brought up the issue of discrimination against students with disabilities, highlighting the fear of retaliation that prevents many students from reporting incidents. They mentioned the concept of "invisible hate crimes" and asked how we incorporate protections for people with disabilities into the Commissions work.

- Commissioner Levin acknowledged the lack of representation for the disabled community and emphasized the importance of considering their voices. He further highlighted the difficulties in obtaining data for this community, particularly when intersecting identities are involved.

Another community member wanted to respond to Commissioner Levin's presentation

specifically concerning Muslim Americans. They discussed that hate crimes among this group often go unreported arguing the FBI's numbers are inaccurate. The commenter then shared statistics on discrimination against Muslim Americans and stressed the importance of combating it through education and engagement.

The fourth participant highlighted the ongoing issue of underreporting among individuals with disabilities. They emphasized the need for improved law enforcement training to address the lack of reporting by officers and called for a better classification system for hate crimes against people with disabilities, as many incidents are not recognized as such.

The last person to share a comment discussed the lack of online moderation over hate.

Commissioner Cuellar encouraged anyone interested to submit comments via email. Additionally, she announced a five-minute break.

c. Informational Presentations on Options and Resources for People Targeted for Hate

Commissioner Cuellar introduced the next presenters Christina Teixeira and Gregory Mann.

a. Know your Rights and Options if Targeted for Hate

Gregory Mann began the presentation with the following:

CRD Disclaimer that the information in the presentation does not constitute legal advice.

The first informational slide outlined the options and rights available to victims and witnesses of hate incidents. Definitions of hate crimes, hate incidents, and the distinction between criminal and civil law were provided.

Christina Teixeira continued the presentation by addressing:

Options for victims and witnesses of hate crimes and how to report it. This included options such as calling 911, seeking assistance from trusted organizations, offering support to victims, practicing self-regulation, finding emotional support, being an ally, and contacting CA v. Hate.

Documenting expressions of hate and collecting evidence were emphasized. If there is no evidence, the safety of the victim and witness is the most important. When reporting, provide as many details and characteristics as possible. Be sure to state the incident was a hate crime so it documented. Reporting the incident to the FBI, other organizations, CA v. Hate are other options for those who do not wish to report with law enforcement.

Gregory Mann continued the presentation:

He shared information on filing a civil action based on the hate crime or incident through the CRD. such incidents must violate the Ralph Civil Rights Act, which requires violence or threat of violence. The process of filing an administrative complaint with the CRD was provided, along with additional information regarding the provisions of the Ralph Civil Rights Act.

Christina Teixeira concluded by summarizing the key points covered.

Commissioner Cuellar thank Christina Teixeira and Gregory Mann, announcing that public comment will be heard after the next presentation. She introduced Deputy Director Becky Monroe, California Civil Rights Department and Assistant Deputy Director Marquez Equalibria, California Civil Rights Department.

b. Resources Available to People Targeted for Hate

Becky Monroe shared information about the following:

CA v. Hate is a new resource line and network. This a community-centered approach to combating hate by identifying options and next steps for individuals targeted for hate, connecting with culturally competent resources, and improving hate incident and data reporting to enhance preventions and responses. CA vs. Hate is accessible in over 200 languages. The intake process was explained.

Emphasized that this resource is to support, it is private and confidential, and that there is ongoing input and accountability. The resource networks that CA vs. Hate partners with were shared.

Marquez Equalibria concluded the presentation with the following:

The history of the Community Conflict Resolution Unit (CCRU). Went over CCRU's jurisdiction and who CCRU works with. The standard practices are that it is a neutral, impartial, and confidential resource that does not have law enforcement powers.

The free services that CCRU provides include designing conflict resolution processes, facilitating community engagement processes, education and training, technical consultations, and mediating community disputes. Examples of these services were provided to give context.

Commissioner Cuellar thanked Becky Monroe and Marquez Equalibria and announced Commissioner Feiler will moderate public comment.

Commissioner Feiler thanked everyone for their presentations and reminded people that the comment must pertain to the presentations.

Public Comment

No public comment.

IV. Facilitated Public Comment and Discussion

Commissioner Cuellar described the goals of the facilitated public comment and emphasized that the foundation of the Commission's work is community input. She encouraged people to participate. If they didn't feel comfortable speaking up in the forum, they could also email the Commission at CSH@CalCivilRights.ca.gov.

Assistant Deputy Director Marquez Equilibria asked the following questions of the public:

- (1) What are the barriers to reporting hate that you have experienced?
- (2) What are the barriers to accessing resources and support?
- (3) Are you able to access culturally competent resources and support?
- (4) If you or someone you know has targeted for hate, what was an example of a response – from the government or a community-based organization, or a religious institution – that you thought was helpful and effective? Or, what was an example that was not helpful nor effective?
- (5) What are the issues you would like to see addressed in future public forums?

Public Comment

The first commenter recommended doing future presentations on Islamophobia and its impact on Muslims.

Another member of the public shared that there are multiple barriers for people with disabilities and reporting to law enforcement which include people with disabilities being ignored and in many cases the perpetrators being the caregiver.

- Marquez Equilibria asked if there are next steps for the Commission to address some of the barriers mentioned.
- The speaker responded that there is pending legislation that would require law enforcement agencies to receive training on how to interact with these groups as well as require them to reach out to these community groups.

V. Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

Commissioner Cuellar reminded everyone to keep in mind that the Commission may not discuss or act on any matter raised during the public comment section that is not included on this agenda, except whether to decide to place the matter on the agenda of a future meeting.

Public Comment

One member of the public wanted to bring awareness to SB 403 and drew awareness to attacks against Muslims.

VI. Adjournment

Commissioner Feiler thank everyone for attending and reminded everyone that their feedback is critical for the Commission's work.

Commissioner Cuellar adjourned at 2:34 p.m.