



Civil Rights Department Commission on the State of Hate

2218 Kausen Drive, Suite 100 | Elk Grove | CA | 95758
800-884-1684 (voice) | 800-700-2320 (TTY) | California's Relay Service at 711
www.calcivilrights.ca.gov | contact.center@dfeh.ca.gov

COMMISSION ON THE STATE OF HATE

Meeting Notice and Agenda

May 24, 2023

Commissioners Present

Chair Russell Roybal
Commissioner Cynthia Choi
Commissioner Regina Cuellar
Commissioner Andrea Beth Damsky
Commissioner Cece Feiler
Commissioner Brian Levin
Commissioner Shirin Sinnar
Commissioner Erroll G. Southers

Civil Rights Department Staff Present

Adam Romero, CRD Deputy Director
Becky Monroe, CRD Deputy Director
Alec Watts, CRD Deputy Director
Mariel Block, CRD Senior Legislative and Regulatory Counsel
Marquez Equalibria, CRD CCRU
Gregory Mann, CRD CCRU
Christina Teixeira, CRD CCRU

Others Present

An estimated 18 members of the public participated virtually.

I. **Welcome** A. **Call to Order**

Chair Roybal called the meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

They welcomed everyone to the fifth meeting of the California Commission on the State of Hate. Announced translated captioning is available for this meeting.
Chair Roybal acknowledged that it is both AAPI Heritage Month and Jewish American Heritage month.

B. Establishment of a Quorum

CRD Assistant Deputy Director, Alec Watts conducted roll call.

C. Review of the Agenda

Chair Roybal invited everyone to the Commission's first Community Forum that will take place following the Commission meeting. They then reviewed the public comment process.

Chair Roybal reviewed the agenda for the meeting.

II. Approval of the Minutes

Chair Roybal reviewed the minutes from the April meeting and asked for comments, discussion, and public comment on the minutes.

No edits by Commissioners.

Public Comment

No public Comment

Action by the Commission

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve the minutes. Commissioner Choi seconded. The Commission unanimously voted to approve the minutes.

III. Discussion and Action Regarding the Commission's Annual Report

Chair Roybal reminded everyone the Commission's Annual Report is due July 1, 2023, and that the Commission will discuss and take a vote to adopt this version of the report. They then reviewed the overall structure of the report.

Commissioner Feiler moved to approve the current version of the Commission's Annual Report. Commissioner Choi seconded.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Damsky thanked staff and Chair Roybal for their work on the amount of detail that went into the report.

Chair Roybal commended the staff for their hard work throughout the editing and drafting process of the report and laying the groundwork for the future.

Commissioner Choi noted her appreciation that the feedback regarding demographics were essential to develop strategies that would be most responsive to disproportionately impacted communities. She also agreed with Chair Roybal that this was an important first report, because its foundational to the work of the Commission.

Commissioner Levin acknowledged the quick timeline in which the report was written. Additionally, he thanked the amount of work that went into the Commission's Annual Report by the fellow Commissioners and CRD staff.

Public Comment

There was no public comment.

Action by the Commission

Chair Roybal moved to a vote with the caveat that if there are any copy edit changes that need to be made, the CRD staff can make those non-substantive changes.

The Commission unanimously voted to approve the Commission's Annual Report.

Additional Comments by Commissioners

Chair Roybal gave a round of applause for the milestone.

Commissioner Southers asked how this report will be released.

- Alec Watts responded that the CRD is working on how to best distribute the Commission's report.
- Chair Roybal noted that he had a conversation with the CRD's new Director of Communications regarding spreading the word about the report.

IV. Updates from Chair and Subcommittees

A. Chair Russell Roybal

Chair Roybal gave the following updates:

Following this meeting, the first community forum will take place virtually at 11:30. Additionally, they were recently in Sacramento to represent the Commission at the Jewish Public Affairs Council (JPAC) Capitol Summit.

Commissioner Southers was appointed to the LAPD Police Commission.

- Commissioner Southers thanked Chair Roybal.
- Commissioner Feiler gave her congratulations to Commissioner Southers.

Commissioner Feiler inquired about the location of the following Commission meetings.

- Chair Roybal responded that the Bagley-Keene Act is moving through the Legislature on whether the Commission will continue with virtual meetings or transition to a hybrid model.

Vice Chair Salcedo was awarded the Latino Spirit Award by the California Latino Legislative Caucus.

Commissioner Cuellar was recently honored with a resolution from the California State Assembly for her work on AB 1314, a bill to create the Feather Alert System to notify the public when a Native American person goes missing or is endangered.

- Commissioner Cuellar thanked Chair Roybal.

Chair Roybal responded to Commissioner Souther's inquiry about where the report will be available, informing everyone that the Report will be posted on the Commission Website for Commissioners to share.

B. Subcommittee on Data and Research

Commissioner Sinnar provided the following updates:

The Subcommittee has been setting up contracts to accomplish three goals: (1) Develop rigorous data and research in areas related to the prevalence, prevention, and response to hate incidents, (2) translate existing and new research to bridge the gap between research and policy, and (3) make all the data and resources accessible to California communities.

There are five projects that are in the works at various stages. First, they are working with the California Health Interview Survey put out by UCLA Center for Health Policy. Second, the Subcommittee brought on a Sociology PhD and Law student as a consultant to help put together literature reviews on public messaging to help prevent hate crimes. Thirdly, they are developing collaborations with academic hate crime researchers, the Commission, CRD staff, and policymakers to bridge conversations of research and policies. Fourth, they are creating a user-friendly searchable format so community members, organizers, and media can access hate crime related demographics and resources. Lastly is a project focusing on funding research related to anti-trans violence in California, hate crime incident reporting data, and other non-law enforcement data sources.

The Commission has put out a notice for an in-house researcher who can work on other data and research needs as well as looking for other options down the road.

Commission discussion

Commissioner Cuellar asked how the Health Surveys will be distributed.

- Commissioner Sinnar replied that the goal is to be representative survey but is supposed to be representative of all the demographics.

- Alec Watts added that he believes the surveys are mostly through mail and there will be follow-ups if someone doesn't respond. The survey is both representative at both the State and county level.

Commissioner Levin discussed the changing and emerging political threat of violence perpetuated by public officials by not participating in anti-terrorism hearings and spreading misinformation. He highlighted that the Subcommittee and Commission is focused on nonpartisan, academic, and scholarly driven data.

C. **Subcommittee on Policy Recommendations**

Commissioner Choi gave the following update:

The Subcommittee met with Abby Browning to discuss the role of governments in the aftermath of a hate incident. There's an understanding that the infrastructure across the state is uneven in times of crises and there are community organizations that don't always reach out to the government. To counter this, the Subcommittee is working on approaches that do not cause further harm to the communities that have been directly impacted.

Commissioner Cuellar thanked Commissioner Choi for the update and Becky Monroe, and Abby Browning for their contributions.

Commission discussion

Commissioner Sinnar asked if there are other substantive areas that will be focused on, such as: (1) hate incidents not only hate crimes, (2) What is the role of government in crisis response, and (3) Are there additional areas of research that could help since these are topics that the Commission is interested in.

- Commissioner Choi responded that the Subcommittee wanted to prioritize rapid and crisis response. There will also be additional information in the Presentation by Stop AAPI Hate at the Community Forum. The subcommittee has a consultant that will help them identify this by tracking hate crimes, hate acts, and civil rights violations. Because these topics become predictors in where we need to shift our focus both locally and nationally.
- Commissioner Cuellar added that her county has held discussions regarding how different local governments respond to any kind of hate activities, and this is something that is good for the Subcommittee to also look at.

Commissioner Levin noted that when there are higher ranking leaders speaking out on hate crimes incidents reports show there is a decline in hate incidents. There are organized and directed type of violence that is not just spontaneous. Therefore, it is so important to have these actionable types of resources available to help combat hate crimes when they occur.

D. **Subcommittee on Recommendations for Law Enforcement**

Commissioner Damsky shared the following updates:

The Subcommittee is focusing on how to create hate crime and incident-related trainings for law enforcement officers. This includes creating training videos with the help of students, academics, and notable people who will be compelling representatives for law enforcement officers.

An important goal is to encourage officers to engage with their communities to build relationships so the impacted communities will reach out to law enforcement. One place to start is to encourage jurisdictions to have listening sessions with their communities to learn about the biggest threats they are facing. This will help inform the subcommittee on what types of training will fill the gaps.

There have been discussions regarding college campuses and the prevalence of hate crimes in those institutions.

The subcommittee recommends that there be literature reviews conducted and it may potentially bring on a consultant. They also met with Becky Monroe from the Civil Rights Department and Cynthia Deitle who formally worked for the FBI.

Commissioner Southers contributed the following updates:

The work is being done using a holistic approach and the law enforcement has been enthusiastic about helping and wanting to help bridge gaps in communities they want to reach. The trainings will be POST certified.

Commission Discussion

Chair Roybal was glad that that the commission met with Becky Monroe.

E. Subcommittee on Community Forums

Commissioner Feiler discussed the following updates:

The first Community Forum will take place after the Commission meeting. She also discussed the topics of the forums.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Cuellar discussed her excitement for the forum.

Chair Roybal expressed that they are sad they will not be able to attend but is excited to watch the recording

Commissioner Feiler Thanked Alec Watts for his work and the CCRU team.

Public Comment:

One member of the public discussed the underreporting of hate crimes against the disabled community. They asked Commissioner Sinnar if the surveys will have a special focus on people with disabilities.

- Commissioner Sinnar responded that she does not know off hand but will be looking into that.

F. Subcommittee on Funding

This update was skipped at the meeting.

V. Commission Member Announcements

Commissioner Feiler talked about her Mental Health Summit at UCLA and announced she will be taking over as the board Chair of the UCLA Resnick Neuro Psychiatric Hospital next month.

Commissioner Levin shared that Over 500 LGBTQ+ pieces of legislation are happening right now and there are growing numbers of hate crime attacks with the biggest increases being against the LGBTQ community. His research on this will be coming out soon.

Commissioner Damsky announced that she spoke on anti-LGBTQ hate crimes at her local City Council meeting where they discussed proclaiming June as LGBTQ pride month and flying non-government flags which would have prevented flying the pride flag. The motion failed.

- Chair Roybal let the public know that the Commission did not take a position on the resolution as the Commission does not have a process for that yet, though staff is looking into that.

Commissioner Feiler asked Commissioner Levin when his research will come out.

- Commissioner Levin said the research should be out sometime next week but there will be a sneak-peek at the Community Forum presentation.

VI. Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda

The Commission may not discuss or act on any matter raised during the public comment section that is not included on this agenda, except whether to decide to place the matter on the agenda of a future meeting. (Government Code §§ 11125 and 11125.7 (a))

A member of Islamic Networks Group noted that they provide presentations, panels, and diversity training seminars on islamophobia, anti-semitism, anti-black racism, and other forms of bigotry. They recommended that the Commission form a subcommittee on hate-based bullying in schools due to disproportionate bullying occurring against Muslim students. They also would be happy to help serve on that Subcommittee.

- Chair Roybal asked them to forward any information they have to the Commission's email.

Another member of the public wants the Commission to take a position on AB 1079 and AB 449.

VII. Future Agenda Items

Chair Roybal encouraged Commissioners to discuss in their subcommittee meeting about future

agenda items and to email them or Alec Watts to get their topic on the next Agenda. They asked if there are any other comments before they move to adjournment.

Commissioner Feiler wanted to confirm which Commissioners will be attending the Community Forum.

- Chair Roybal responded that Commissioner Sinnar, Commissioner Southers, Commissioner Levin, and Commissioner Damsky will be attending.

VIII. Adjournment of the Meeting

Commissioner Cuellar moved to adjourn. Commissioner Levin seconded. Chair Roybal adjourned the meeting at 10:24 a.m.